A meeting of the Wayne County Apportionment Commission was held on Friday, May 13, 2011, in Room 705, Coleman A. Young Municipal Center, Detroit, Michigan 48226.

Raymond J. Wojtowicz, Chair of the Wayne County Apportionment Commission, called the meeting to order at 10:41 a.m.

Chair Wojtowicz asked the Assistant Director of Elections, Delphine G. Oden, to call the roll. The following members answered the roll call:

Present: Vice-Chair Cathy M. Garrett  
Commissioner William J. Runco  
Commissioner William M. Wolfson  
Chair Raymond J. Wojtowicz

Absent: Commissioner Kym L. Worthy (entered the meeting at 10:46 a.m.)

Ms. Oden informed the commission that a quorum was present.

Also present: Janet Anderson-Davis, Assistant Corporation Counsel  
Delphine G. Oden, Secretary to the Commission  
Trevor Tutro-Anderson  
Robert Levi  
Kevin Kavanagh, Assistant Corporation Counsel'  
Gregory P. Mahar  
Sao Hang  
Pamela Lane  
Gregory Parrish, Data Driven Detroit  
Kat Hartman, Data Driven Detroit  
Kurt Metzger, Data Driven Detroit  
John Pfeiffer  
R. Fisher  
Bill Johnson  
Jeff Bors  
Larry Arreguin  
Joan Gebhardt  
Alan Helmkamp  
Paula Bowman  
Shannon Price  
Khalid Mohammed  
Sally Kim  
Diane Webb
Chair Wojtowicz requested a motion to adopt the agenda, as presented. Moved by Commissioner Garrett, supported by Commissioner Wolfson to approve the agenda, as presented. A roll call vote was taken, as follows:

YEAS: Commissioners Garrett, Runco, Wolfson, and Chair Wojtowicz. NAYS: None. ABSENT: Commissioner Worthy.

Chair Wojtowicz requested a motion to adopt the Minutes of May 6, 2011. Moved by Commissioner Garrett, supported by Chair Wojtowicz, that the Minutes of May 6, 2011, are hereby approved as presented. A roll call vote was taken, as follows:

YEAS: Commissioners Garrett, Runco and Chair Wojtowicz. NAYS: None. ABSTENTION: Commissioner Wolfson. ABSENT: Commissioner Worthy.

Commissioner Runco informed the commission that he received a letter from Bernard Parker expressing concern about the commission’s compliance with the Voting Rights Act. There was concern regarding the loss of population, making sure not to under represent the minority population in the City of Detroit and violating the Voting Rights Act. Commissioner Runco indicated that research had been done and found a 2008 U.S. Supreme Court Case – Bartlett vs. Strickland. Ms. Anderson-Davis inquired as to whether or not the commission would like corporation counsel to do a memo or a summary. (Commissioner Worthy entered the meeting at 10:46 a.m.). Commissioner Runco indicated that a memo or summary be provided to the commission.

Chair Wojtowicz moved to Item 5(a) Presentation of Staff Plan, 1st Iteration, May 11th version. Commissioner Wolfson supported by Commissioner Runco that the commission receive the presentation of the Staff Plan, 1st Iteration, May 11th version by Data Driven Detroit. A roll call vote was taken, as follows:

YEAS: Commissioners Garrett, Runco, Wolfson, Worthy and Chair Wojtowicz. NAYS: None. ABSENT: None.

Mr. Metzger indicated that the presentation was based on comments received. Discussion and comments ensued: the target population of 121,372 is the 2010 population; the rules indicate the deviation is 11.9% and there is a deviation of 8.45%; highest population is in District 10 and the lowest population is in District 8; there are seven districts of majority-minority population and currently there are 8 districts; there were population gains in the City of Dearborn, Northville, Plymouth, Canton, Van Buren, Huron and Brownstown; Sumpter Township lost population; Brownstown Township gained 33%, City of Detroit lost 25%, Highland Park lost 30%; Huron Township gained 16%, Inkster lost 16% and Northville City lost population; tried to hold the communities whole in the plan. District 1 in prior plans started through the Pointes, Harper Woods and across the northern part of the City of Detroit – tried to maintain communities, follow voting districts and increase compactness; Asian population is concentrated in Canton, Plymouth and Northville Townships, Hamtramck, Wayne State University area; African American population is concentrated in the City of Detroit, Highland Park, River Rouge, Inkster and some movement into Canton, Northville, Westland and Livonia. The Census Bureau released a file called the Group Quarters Population File which is anybody living in non-typical households like dormitories, homes for the elderly, etc.; the incarcerated population concentration is in the Mound Road facility, Hamtramck and the downtown jail.
Mr. Metzger indicated that four communities are split in the plan and there were two splits in the 2001 plan – Cities of Detroit and Livonia; the new plan splits Cities of Livonia, Westland, Allen Park and Detroit; produced a detailed map for each of the districts, identified communities, and gave detailed description of all the boundary streets; and there are no split precincts and voting districts were not taken into consideration.

Commissioner Worthy asked if there was a way to overlay the jurisdictions on the maps and Mr. Metzger indicated it could be done, although it will be a little more confusing. Moved by Commissioner Wolfson, supported by Commissioner Worthy to receive and file with the additional request for information. A roll call vote was taken, as follows:

YEAS: Commissioners Garrett, Runco, Wolfson, Worthy and Chair Wojtowicz. NAYS: None. ABSENT: None.

Commissioner Gebhardt commented on the facilities in the City of Dearborn and thought it might be Henry Ford Village rather than an incarcerated population. Mr. Metzger indicated that Henry Ford Village would be considered individual households.

Commissioner Wolfson moved, supported by Vice Chair Garrett, that a plan be drawn which takes into account some of the history of the county and some of the historical communities of interest; that groups Hamtramck and Highland Park, which are small communities within a larger central city which have been grouped together for the last 50 years constitute a third in a significant minority in any district; gets less cuts and maintain compactness, by rather than an east/west cut in Livonia, using the north/south cut that has been historically done along the Jeffries Freeway, and perhaps Five Mile; groups Plymouth and Northville which have been grouped together for quite some time, and share municipal services; the communities that border Washtenaw County, such as the communities of interest, Brownstown, along Monroe County on the river, should include Canton in that it would make it geographically more compact, and maintain deviations and fewer splits as the new 14th or 15th, depending on the iteration, is a particularly large district. For transparency this should be done collectively as a body. A roll call vote was taken, as follows:

YEAS: Commissioners Garrett, Worthy, Wolfson, and Chair Wojtowicz. NAYS: Commissioner Runco. ABSENT: None.

(Note: Commissioner Garrett indicated yes because her concern is to have an additional plan with all of the variables that we are concerned about, the Voting Rights Act, etc., and to make the best decision that this body can based on all of the requirements. Commissioner Worthy indicated yes for the reasons stated in the earlier discussion).

Chair Wojtowicz asked for Public Comment. The following comments were made:

Larry Arreguin, Michigan Hispanic Chamber of Commerce indicated that the plan that was presented had wrong numbers.

Paula Bowman, League of Women Voters of Northwest Wayne County addressed the Board regarding concerns with this plan.
Mr. Mohammed from Commissioner Martha G. Scott’s staff addressed the Board re clarifying whether keeping Highland Park and Hamtramck together would be in support of the 1965 Voting Rights Act.

Sally Kim, Asian and Pacific Islander American Vote, Michigan addressed the Board regarding the Asian population and that it could form a community of interest.

Commissioner Runco spoke regarding the opinion of the United States Supreme Court, which in 2008 held that the Voter Rights Act does not require state official to redraw election district lines to allow a racial minority group to feasibly join with crossover voters to elect the minority’s candidate – the minority candidate’s choice when racial minority groups would make up less than 50% of the voting population of redrawn districts; according to the Supreme Court, the Voter Rights Act allows redistricting only when a geographically compact group of minority voters would form a majority of the redrawn election district.

Chair Wojtowicz reminded everyone that the commission requested another plan and it will be under full discussion in full disclosure; a private citizen has the right, according to state law, that after a plan, whatever plan number that is decided on, will be available them to be challenged and any member of the public in Wayne County will be able to present their own plan.

Ms. Anderson-Davis addressed the commission and indicated that the commission was getting very close to the date when voters or the public can submit plans, June 6th, and wondered if the commission would like to establish or inform the public of the criteria for what the commission wants to see in a plan prior to the June 6th date.

Commissioner Wolfson indicated that the commission would address this at the next meeting.

Chair Wojtowicz indicated that the commission continues the meeting in the next Friday session. Commissioner Garret informed the commission that she would be out of town and will not be able to attend the next meeting.

Chair Wojtowicz called for adjournment. Moved by Commissioner Wolfson, supported by Commissioner Worthy that the meeting is hereby adjourned at 11:51a.m. A roll call vote was taken, as follows:

YEAS: Commissioners Garrett, Runco, Wolfson, Worthy and Chair Wojtowicz.
NAYS: None. ABSENT: None.

Respectfully submitted,

Delphine G. Oden, Secretary